

**Governor’s Office of Land Use and Climate Innovation (LCI)**  
**Integrated Climate Adaptation and Resiliency Program (ICARP)**  
**Technical Advisory Committee (TAC)**

October 25, 2024

SUMMARY

**TAC Members Present:**

- Abby Edwards, LCI
- Jacob Alvarez<sup>1</sup>, City of Coachella
- Nathan Bengtsson, PG&E
- Allison Brooks, Bay Area Regional Collaborative
- Kim Clark, Southern California Association of Governments
- Grant Davis, Sonoma County Water Agency
- Alex Ghenis<sup>2</sup>, Accessible Climate Strategies
- Sloane Viola<sup>3</sup>, California Natural Resources Agency
- Lucy Levin, California Environmental Protection Agency<sup>4</sup>
- Virginia Jameson, California Department of Food and Agriculture
- Denise Kadara, Allensworth Progressive Association

- Nayamin Martinez, Central California Environmental Justice Network
- Hannah Walter, California State Transportation Agency<sup>5</sup>
- Lori Nezhura, California Governor’s Office of Emergency Services
- Jonathan Parfrey, Climate Resolve
- Michelle Passero, The Nature Conservancy
- Linda Helland, California Department of Public Health
- John Wentworth, Town of Mammoth Lakes

**TAC Members Absent:**

- Veronic Beaty, CA Coalition for Rural Housing
- David Loya, City of Arcata
- Will Madrigal, Jr., Climate Science Alliance
- Sona Mohnot, Greenlining Institute
- Roberto Carlos Torres, Institute for Local Government
- Gloria Walton, The Solutions Project

**Item 1: Housekeeping and Roll Call**

Sam Magill, Sacramento State University College of Continuing Education, reviewed the agenda and discussed meeting logistics for in person and online attendees. Elea Becker Lowe, LCI conducted a roll call. With 17 members present, quorum was reached and the meeting was called to order. Magill also introduced the newest member of the TAC, Abby Edwards. Edwards serves as LCI’s Deputy Director for Climate and Planning Programs.

---

<sup>1</sup> Participated remotely; does not count towards quorum within the Bagley Keene Open Meetings Act  
<sup>2</sup> Participate remotely; counts towards quorum within the Bagley Keene Open Meetings Act  
<sup>3</sup> Alternate for Amanda Hanson, California Natural Resources Agency

<sup>4</sup> Alternate for Sarah Izant, California Environmental Protection Agency  
<sup>5</sup> Alternate for Darwin Moosavi, California State Transportation Agency

## **Item 2: Welcoming Remarks and Appointment of TAC Chair**

Samuel Assefa, Director, LCI, provided opening remarks for the TAC. Director Assefa provided a history of LCI (formerly the Governor’s Office of Planning and Research), including the recent name change. The change was intended to focus LCI on its core strengths and primary functions of land use and planning, climate and the environment, research and education, and intergovernmental coordination. He noted that within LCI, ICARP’s longevity makes it a leader in California’s response to climate impacts with a focus on resiliency for all communities. After opening remarks, he thanked TAC members and the public for attending.

After opening remarks by Director Assefa, Magill led the TAC in the appointment of a new chair for the TAC. Abby Edwards was nominated as the Chair. No other candidates requested consideration for the position of chair.

### Public Comment

None

### Action

Jonathan Parfrey made a motion to approve the chair with a second from Grant Davis for approval of Edwards as chair. The TAC unanimously approved her appointment with 17 ayes, 0 noes, and 0 abstaining.

Aye: Abby Edwards, Jacob Alvarez, Nathan Bengtsson, Allison Brooks, Kim Clark, Grant Davis, Alex Ghenis, Sloane Viola, Lucy Levin, Virginia Jameson, Denise Kadara, Nayamin Martinez, Hannah Walter, Lori Nezhura, Jonathan Parfrey, Michelle Passero, Linda Helland, John Wentworth

No: None

Abstain: None

## **Item 3: Approval of Draft Meeting Minutes**

Magill led discussion and approval of the March 29, 2024, TAC meeting minutes. After a brief introduction, the following conversation was recorded:

- Alex Ghenis requested his organization be changed to “Accessible Climate Strategies” in the minutes.

### Public Comment

None.

### Action

John Wentworth made a motion to approve the minutes with the modification listed above; Kim Clark seconded. With 15 ayes, 0 noes, and 2 abstaining, the minutes were approved.

Aye: Abby Edwards, Jacob Alvarez, Nathan Bengtsson, Allison Brooks, Kim Clark, Grant Davis, Alex Ghenis, Sloane Viola, Lucy Levin, Virginia Jameson, Nayamin Martinez, Hannah Walter, Lori Nezhura, Jonathan Parfrey, Michelle Passero, John Wentworth

No: None

Abstain: Denise Kadara, Linda Helland

## **Item 4: State Agency Report Out**

Edwards facilitated a series of report outs from each agency:

#### California Governor's Office of Emergency Services (CalOES)

Lori Nezhura, CalOES, provided an update on CalOES climate response and resilience activities. She noted that ICARP plays an important role in integrating climate policy into emergency management and response. Specific climate resilience activities within CalOES included:

- The Climate Adaptation Planning Guide (due in 2025)
- Hazards Mitigation Grants to implement activities in the Guide
- Stream temperature response activities
- Crisis communications and extreme temperature response: CalOES holds coordination calls with local jurisdictions, conducts social media outreach, and conducts earned media interviews to coordinate extreme heat response communications. More information is available at <https://www.listoscalifornia.org/>.
- Update to the 2024 State Emergency Plan due in 2025, with emphasis on the [Extreme Temperature Response Plan](#) Annex.
- Hazard mitigation activities are being conducted to advance policy work and tap into Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) grants and other funding.

In addition to Nezhura's updates, Melissa Boudrye, CalOES added that CalOES acknowledges the need for mitigation projects. As a result, the Resiliency Branch was established to assist with the development of local mitigation plans to access funding. The Resiliency Branch hopes to establish hazard mitigation working groups with a statewide plan due in 2028. The goal of the working groups is to integrate resiliency efforts already underway into a more cohesive strategic approach to resiliency throughout the State of California. Additionally, CalOES will host the Hazard Mitigation Summit December 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup>, 2024 to formally launch the working groups in coordination with locals and partner state agencies.

#### California Natural Resources Agency (CNRA)

Sloane Viola, CNRA provided an update on CNRA's climate action planning and implementation efforts and accomplishments, including:

- CNRA Secretary Wade Crowfoot is participating in COP 29 and is currently in Colombia for COP 16 focused on biodiversity. Secretary Crowfoot will highlight California's commitment and implementation progress for biodiversity protection through the 30x30 initiative. The 30x30 implementation report was released in September and highlights specific progress such as conservation efforts protecting 25% of California's land and 16% of coastal waters. The COP process reinforces California's commitment to engaging with international partners on climate resilience, clean energy, extreme heat, biodiversity, and traditional ecological knowledge.
- On October 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2024, the Klamath Dam Removal Project concluded ahead of schedule and under budget. This represents the largest dam removal infrastructure project in history. Fish are now swimming freely on 400 miles of river for the first time in 100 years, with salmon being reported all the way into Oregon. Riparian restoration represents the next phase of the project.
- California is initiating significant projects in the Salton Sea, with an anticipated 750 acres of conservation habitat. This project was made possible in part from a \$70 million grant from the US Bureau of Reclamation and will be coordinated by the new Salton Sea Conservancy.
- The Wildfire and Forest Resilience Task Force recently released its updated Interagency Treatment Dashboard and the new CalFire Fuel Treatment Dashboard. These tools track forest fuels treatment

on local, Tribal, state, and federal lands beginning in 2021, and show that over 1 million acres of treatment have occurred. Prescribed fire treatments more than doubled between 2021 and 2023.

#### California Department of Public Health (CDPH)

Linda Helland, CDPH, provided updates on CDPH activities to reduce the impacts of climate change on Californians, particularly within vulnerable populations. She noted that while CDPH's budget has been significantly reduced due to state budget deficits, CDPH continues to make progress towards surveillance of climate change related conditions such as heat related illness in partnership with the US Centers for Disease Control National Syndromic Surveillance Program. This work coordinates observation of California's 340 emergency departments to detect and act on climate related illness in real time. Additional updates included:

- An occupational worker heat program to educate employers of at-risk workers (including both outdoor and in-door workers) to protect against heat illnesses.
- Technical assistance communications, policy guidance, and small grant support to Tribes and local health jurisdictions to reduce inequitable impacts of the climate crisis. One example is a contract with the Pala Band of Mission Indians to create a heat mitigation plan, components of which will be made available to other Tribes as a starter kit for their own plans and contracts with Tule River Tribe, the Hambematolel Pomo of Upper Lake, and Hoopa Valley for climate planning/climate vulnerability assessments.
- A Climate Change and Health Equity Working Group was established in 2023 within CDPH to discuss climate and health impacts for maternal and child health.
- Trainings for community health workers in Tulare County to improve housing and health outcomes related to climate change.
- An advisory group is being formed to learn about and advise CDPH on current climate change initiatives across all agencies. TAC members were encouraged to look out for advisory group notices in the near future.

#### California Environmental Protection Agency

Lucy Levin, CalEPA, delivered an update on behalf of CalEPA related to the CalHeatScore program. In May 2024, CalEPA launched the CalHeatScore effort to create an extreme heat scoring system. By providing real-time information, early warnings, education, and local resources to prepare for extreme heat events. The program is intended for release in January 2025. Levin also noted CalEPA Secretary Garcia is participating in the COP events with CNRA Secretary Crowfoot.

#### California State Transportation Agency (CalSTA)

Hannah Walter, CalSTA, provided two updates on CalSTA programs: online public maps to overlay climate impacts to the state transportation system for release in 2025 and a climate risk assessment methodology to allow CalTrans districts to prioritize climate adaptation projects. CalSTA is also coordinating with other agencies such as CalOES and LCI to look at climate impacts and expand resiliency efforts across the state transportation system. This study will launch in fiscal year (FY) 2025/26.

#### TAC Discussion

Edwards led a discussion session with TAC members on the state agency updates listed above. The input and questions received are as follows; chair/staff responses are provided below as sub-bullets:

- Grant Davis, Sonoma County Water Agency (Sonoma Water), noted the impressive work conducted for the Klamath River Restoration Effort. In particular, Davis highlighted collaboration with Tribes involved in restoration and endangered species recovery efforts.
- Jonathan Parfey, Climate Resolve, thanked CalOES for their presentations and their work to transfer climate related emergency work to the new CalOES Resiliency Branch. He then asked if there are any opportunities to supplement FEMA resources with CalOES funding, particularly on issues FEMA may not be able to address such as community projects to prevent [heat related] injury and death.
  - Nezhura responded the Governor and Legislature created the Prepare California Program to address some of these issues. Although it was a “1-time” program, there was sufficient funding to carry it over multiple years. There is also a wildfire home hardening program for communities. Nezhura added that matching requirements to receive federal funds can be challenging for smaller agencies and communities. Boudrye added that one of the major efforts at the state level is developing research to clearly link community health and wellbeing impacts to climate change. Developing a benefit cost analysis (BCA) showing this linkage will create additional opportunities for federal funding. Braden Kay, LCI, noted that agencies are collaborating on investments and the BCA to show FEMA the need for more funding and policy changes to address extreme heat efforts, as the signs of heat related illness may not be readily visible.
- Alex Ghenis, Accessible Climate Strategies, echoed the need for more funding for CDPH climate programs; continued budget deficits and cuts to public health programs raise red flags. He also noted that the BCA discussed above should include “lives saved” and not just the economic value of individuals. He also noted that extreme heat can affect transportation networks such as railways planned for High-Speed Rail in the Central Valley. He asked CalSTA how vulnerability assessments could be conducted as part of a BCA to prioritize more sustainable transportation in the future.
  - Walter noted the CalSTA is incorporating this concept into its CalBC model to incorporate climate adaptation projects into its portfolio. Part of this work is to include not just *benefits* in the model but also cost *avoidance* in future projects [that may be impacted by climate change].
- Nayamin Martinez, Central California Environmental Justice Network, asked CalEPA who the lead department is for the Cal Heat Score program, and who the intended audience will be.
  - Levin, CalEPA said Cal Heat Score targets a broad array of individuals and offered to connect Martize with the Cal Heat Score team for more information.
  - Helland noted that CDPH and LCI/ICARP under Braden Kay are coordinating communications on Cal Heat Score. The goal is to provide health data on morbidity and mortality from extreme heat to support connection with and recommendations for local health departments and other local agencies. This includes both warnings and recommendations for both rapid intervention before/during events where harm occurs, but also long-term planning to prevent injury and illness.
- Michelle Passero, the Nature Conservancy, asked Edwards for more information about the name change from OPR to LCI, and whether it will guide future planning and focus for the agency.
  - Edwards responded the shift was intended to more accurately reflect the work LCI does, and spin off/reorganize departments and programs that don’t fit within the LCI umbrella. One example included moving California Jobs First to GoBiz.

**Item 5: ICARP Programmatic Updates and Staff Report**

Edwards provided updates for ICARP, including the introduction of new ICARP staff members Cora Ballek, Hanna Bliska, Bryce Lewis-Smith, Kelly Meza Prado, and Rico Miranda. After the introduction of new staff, Kim Danko, LCI provided additional updates on ICARP efforts including:

- The 5<sup>th</sup> Climate Change Assessment team is currently in negotiations with academic institutions to develop statewide topical synthesis reports on climate induced human migration and displacement, climate impacts to the economy, and racial equity/climate justice.
- Coordination is underway on the use of data products/integration of cross cutting themes for the regional resilience grant program, and \$21.8 million in grants have been executed for the Vulnerable Communities Program (VCP). VCP held interagency review and input sessions across five climate hazards to identify and prioritize relevant social vulnerability issues. Four hazards have been completed; the wildfire hazard review is in progress.
- Staff continue to work on a variety of opportunities to leverage FEMA funding, including VCP and an EPA Gov 2 grant. The latter will launch soon to help support community informed extreme heat, adaptation, planning, and community resilience.

After the updates, the following input/questions were recorded from TAC members:

- Nezhura asked if the 5<sup>th</sup> Climate Change Assessment team is coordinating with the National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST) on the creation of open-source data using NISTgrants.
  - Becker Lowe responded ICARP is still in the scoping process for the 5<sup>th</sup> Climate Assessment [for grant opportunities] and is interested in learning more/collecting additional ideas.

#### **Item 6: California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA) Climate Resilience Strategy for California Agriculture Overview**

Deputy Secretary for Working Lands Virginia Jameson and Dr. Nina Bingham, CDFA, delivered an update on CDFA's Climate Resilience Strategy for California Agriculture. Work on the Strategy came out of CDFA's Ag Vision 2030 process, where a cross section of agency, community, and agricultural industry experts stated the need to foster a climate smart, resilient, and regenerative agricultural system in California. The document is intended address both CDFA-specific activities and those happening at other agencies to create agricultural climate resilience, including opportunities for collaboration with and funding from federal entities. Public comment on the document will start in 2025. Specific points of Jameson and Bingham's presentation included:

- An overview of challenges for agriculture attributed to climate change.
- Opportunities for action for public agencies, including collaboration across agencies working on these issues, such as a nearly \$1 billion investment in climate smart agriculture over the last 10 years.
- An overview and call for review of the current draft by TAC members with a focus on Chapter 2 (water resources), Chapter 3 (land use), Chapter 4 (air quality), Chapter 10 (workforce and tools), Chapter 11 (energy), and Chapter 12 (economic opportunities).
- Breakdowns of agriculture's contribution to greenhouse gas emissions: agriculture accounts for approximately 8% of California greenhouse gases, with livestock production accounting for roughly 70% of those emissions.
- Opportunities for technical assistance to agricultural producers, including training and support for individuals providing technical assistance.

After the presentation, the following discussion was recorded from TAC members:

- Allison Brooks, Bay Area Regional Collaborative, asked how efforts like the Collaborative's Bay Area Agricultural Plan Framework can organize at the regional scale around natural and working lands to address components of the CDFA Strategy. Agriculture accounts for 45% of the Bay Area's landscape.
  - Jameson noted funding may still be available to assist with regional planning efforts. California Jobs First/GoBiz may also be able to assist as well; a major issue is being able to clearly describe what makes your region special, and what some of the specific impacts of climate change might be to your industry (in this case, agriculture).
  - Passero stressed the importance of the intersection between Chapter 3 (land use) in the Strategy and Chapter 12 (economic opportunities). The protection of working and natural landscapes is a major local government issue and funding tends to be stochastic. In the future, it would be helpful if ICARP could support efforts to create sustainable funding/avoid the ups and downs of funding availability.
- Denise Kadera, Allensworth Progressive Association, noted that her community of Allensworth was heavily impacted by flooding in 2023. Despite being a vulnerable community, Allensworth has been able to secure state funding for the transition to more sustainable/regenerative agriculture, training for farmers, pilot projects for sustainable farming, and recreation opportunities utilizing passive open space. Kadera said Allensworth could be a model community for the TAC to look at. It could also serve as a model for other small, disadvantaged communities throughout California.
  - Jameson responded that CDFA would like to lift up what Allensworth is doing as a model in the strategy to paint a picture about what holistic sustainability looks like.
  - Edwards noted the TAC is a great venue for facilitating these types of discussions and case studies. Chair Edwards and TAC members also supported the idea of a TAC meeting in Allensworth to see the community firsthand.
- Martinez noted the California Environmental Justice Network received a grant from CDFA to begin planning the Central Valley Agroecology Network. The Network established a sustainable demonstration farm southwest of Fresno to give farm workers the opportunity to employ sustainable farming techniques and consume the produce they personally grow. The demonstration farm also includes training on permaculture and agroecology principles. Martinez stressed the need for technical assistance for small farmers, tailored to their primary language. This assistance should include grant writing support/training. She also commented that the shift towards almonds from other crops has exacerbated air quality and water availability issues, and asked if CDFA can do anything to address the proliferation of almond farms. Finally, Martinez asked if CDFA is considering pesticide use in its Strategy, and whether sustainable pest management is included.
  - Jameson responded CDFA would like to learn more about the demonstration farm and echoed the need for more specific technical assistance opportunities. Jameson added that multiple opportunities for technical assistance exist through CDFA, the Natural Resources Conservation Service, and groups like the Chico State Regenerative Agriculture Program. More assistance is always needed. Jameson noted a recently held technical assistance conference where TA providers were brought together to discuss how we can facilitate supporting the TA provider network and needs.
  - Jameson stated the shift towards almond cultivation is driven in part by global commodity pricing, which is difficult for CDFA to influence. However, CDFA is working on efforts to make food systems more local through programs like the Farm to School Program to connect local farmers to the school districts in their areas.

- Jameson noted CDFA does have the Integrated Pest Management Strategy in standalone pesticide section of the Strategy.
- Kim Clark, Southern California Association of Governments (SACOG), noted more information on the economic value of natural and working lands helps local jurisdictions with planning. Clark asked if the CDFA Strategy has any emphasis in the land use chapter on the importance of preserving these lands to reduce urban sprawl and vehicle miles traveled/greenhouse gas emissions from transportation.
  - Jameson noted there are a number of state programs to protect farmland, but conservation easements are very expensive. Although the state is making progress, it still has a ways to go to protect more than the amount of agricultural land being converted to urban uses. The local planning process is extremely important to address zoning and urban growth boundaries.
- Ghenis asked if California can endorse densification of already urbanized land and job centers. He added that property tax structures in California may push suburban development into farmland. Ghenis also asked if the CDFA Strategy includes a section on pathogens in food production.
  - Jameson responded the Strategy will include a section on the importance of healthy soils and the role compost/manure application plays in it. Jameson also noted conversations are ongoing at the state level about the integration of animal production with produce cultivation and agreed that there are areas where it may/may not be appropriate from a food safety standpoint. She added that in the 2023 floods, many acres of farmland were inundated leading to the introduction of a range of pathogens. Any time this occurs, there are restrictions on when farming can start again which may have a significant impact on the farm economy. This is another area where technical assistance could provide an outsized role by providing the training necessary to minimize the introduction of pathogens wherever possible.

#### Public Comment

Magill facilitated public comment after the TAC discussion. One member of the public provided the following comment:

- Nina Knierim, CORE, thanked the TAC for the opportunity to participate, and stressed the need for more local nonprofit participation in the TAC, as these organizations are generally the ones conducting work at the ground level.

After public comment, the TAC adjourned for lunch.

### **BREAK FOR LUNCH**

#### **Item 7: 2023-2024 ICARP Impact Report**

After returning from lunch, a TAC quorum was reestablished. Ben McMahan, ICARP, provided an overview of the 2023/24 ICARP Impact Report, including a short history of the program, accomplishments since 2017, and efforts to elevate the emphasis on equity spanning across ICARP programs as well as the holistic impact of ICARP programmatic activities. After the overview, McMahan reviewed TAC feedback provided during the March 2024 meeting, including comments on the timing/scope for TAC review, the need to elevate an emphasis on equity within the report, and defining “vulnerability” in the context of VCP. Based on these comments, staff revised the report to include better holistic connections across ICARP programs, elevate equity as a theme across all ICARP areas of focus, reflect new workstream activity, and modify the timeline of the report to include an emphasis on 2024 activities. He closed the presentation by discussing how the Report will be used to promote the accomplishments of ICARP programs and evaluate how well these



programs are working. He noted that ICARP is still figuring out how to operationalize changes mentioned in the Report but will include the TAC in these discussions.

After the presentation, the following TAC discussion was recorded:

- Viola thanked staff for their work modifying the Report based on TAC feedback and including equity as a cross-cutting theme throughout the document.
- Passero thanked staff for the modifications to the Report and asked the TAC/ICARP to consider how the Report's recommendations will roll into larger statewide goals around climate change and resilience. Passero also noted that the Report specifically and ICARP generally have a continued need to integrate discussions and work around climate benefits, adaptation, resilience, and greenhouse gas mitigation into all work without parsing out each aspect of climate change. Discussions around climate change should be as holistic as possible.
- John Wentworth, Town of Mammoth Lakes, thanked staff for the work done to modify the Report, and did not have additional comments on the document. Wentworth suggested future TAC/ICARP work should highlight the fact that the climate has changed and will continue to change, and that many of the impacts of this change may not be pleasant. Moreover, Wentworth said future iterations of this document should think in terms of reporting difficult situations to be a reliable, objective source of information on what has happened, what is happening, and likely future scenarios. This could include population movement to cooler elevations.
- Nathan Bengtsson, PG&E, thanked staff for their work on the Report.

#### Public Comment

None.

#### Action

Brooks made a motion to approve the chair with a and second from Wentworth for approval of the 2023/24 ICARP Impact Report. The TAC unanimously approved the Report with 16 ayes, 0 noes, and 2 abstaining or absent.

Aye: Abby Edwards, Jacob Alvarez, Nathan Bengtsson, Allison Brooks, Alex Ghenis, Sloane Viola, Lucy Levin, Virginia Jameson, Denise Kadara, Nayamin Martinez, Hannah Walter, Lori Nezhura, Jonathan Parfrey, Michelle Passero, Linda Helland, John Wentworth

No: None

Abstain: Kim Clark, Grant Davis

#### **Item 8: ICARP Grant Program Policy Memo**

Dolores Barajas, program manager for the ICARP Regional Resiliency Grant Program (RRGP) and Brandon Harrell, program manager for the ICARP Adaptation Planning Grant Program (APGP), provided a presentation on the ICARP Grant Program Policy Memo. The memo discussed bridging the implementation gap challenges and opportunities for California's resilience funding landscape developed by the Center for Law Energy and the Environment, or CLEE at the UC Berkeley School of Law on behalf of ICARP. The RRGF report was published in January and submitted to the Legislature; the APGP was published in the summer of 2024. The Memo summarizes both reports and makes specific findings and recommendations.

CLEE's preliminary analysis of California's resiliency funding landscape was motivated by the need for a strategic and proactive approach to funding adaptation efforts. The Memo found both grant programs were

impacted by reductions in the State’s General Fund, suggesting the need for a broader review of the funding landscape for adaptation programs. It goes on to make a series of findings for improving the funding landscape with priority actions identified for State grant administrators and policymakers, including:

- APGP and RRGP were valuable additions to the State’s resilience funding portfolio, with applications far exceeding available funding. Nonetheless, case studies from the Ramona Barona Climate Adaptation Action Plan and the Santa Ana River Watershed Climate Adaptation and Resilience Plan show a clear need for more stable and sustainable funding.
- State adaptation funding in California is characterized by an oversubscribed, unstable, and complex funding landscape which reduces the State’s ability to advance its adaptation priorities.
- There are multiple opportunities for the State to refine its approach to adaptation funding, building on a track record of investments in climate, science, and community-led adaptation initiatives.

The full report is available online at <https://www.law.berkeley.edu/research/cee/research/land-use/californias-adaptation-and-resilience-funding-landscape/bridging-the-implementation-gap/>. After the presentation, the following discussion from TAC members was recorded:

- Wentworth asked if the TAC can formally adopt the Memo and its findings, and what role the TAC has in advocating for specific policy positions.
  - Edwards said staff/legal counsel will look into the request and develop a response.
- Kadera noted grantees have expressed frustration at the lack of funds, and the complexity of the grant application process. As a case study, the US Department of Agriculture (USDA) offered \$50,000 in funding as long as matching funds were available. However, small communities like Allensworth have difficulty providing matching funds. Through discussions with USDA however, it was able to connect Allensworth with other CBOs and NGOs to find the necessary matching funds. This approach could be utilized in other communities, but agencies must be available to help support the effort to find matching funds.
  - Barajas responded that the RRPG program encouraged using funds for match dollars for other programs, supporting the full life cycle of funding.
- Martinez highlighted the importance of “stacking” matching funds to receive larger grant awards but stressed the need for technical assistance in applying for state and federal funds. Small, unincorporated, and underserved communities do not have the capacity to apply for complex state and federal funding opportunities.
- Parfrey noted that the oversubscription of LCI’s grant programs points to the need. While it may be difficult for state agencies to weigh in on advocating for specific funding, those TAC entities that are not could come together and make recommendations related to investment in climate resilience. Interested in caucusing with fellow nonprofits to become a voice.

### Public Comment

Magill facilitated public comment on the ICARP Grant Policy Memo. Two individuals provided comments:

- Michael McCormick, Farallon Strategies, said that a significant amount of nonprofit time is needed to develop grants, and regional [nonprofit] climate collaboratives provide free technical assistance support the development of those grants. He highlighted that consistent and sustainable funding critical: if funding isn’t consistent, people stop looking for grant opportunities/aren’t aware of them. McCormick noted the Memo is consistent with previous reports, including the [Climate Crossroads Report from the California Resilience Partnership](#), the Strategic Growth Council’s Better Funding Initiative, and others the TAC may want to look at/coordinate with. Finally, he noted that many

grantees struggle with reporting criteria, and suggested the TAC and State could look at how to align project plans and budgets with the actual reporting requirements.

- Melissa Boudrye, CalOES, offered CalOES support through the technical assistance division within the new Resilience Branch. There have been conversations with other state partners to create a funding alignment working group to look at how funding sources could be streamlined or where leveraging opportunities with federal funding programs may exist.

### **Item 9: ICARP History Discussion**

Kay presented a brief history and overview of ICARP to help ground the TAC in the creation of 2025 priorities. ICARP was created by statute in 2015 to coordinate climate adaptation efforts at the local, regional and state level. ICARP seeks to ensure climate equity is a focal point of those adaptation efforts. The TAC is intended to facilitate between agencies and communities. Some of the key accomplishments of ICARP include:

- Creation of the Climate Adaptation Clearinghouse as a comprehensive resource for climate data/tools.
- Development of technical assistance programs to provide guidance to local and regional governments.
- Drafting the Adaptation Planning Guide to support local climate strategies.
- Creation of a Vision and Guiding Principles for resilience to guide state efforts.
- Development of the Climate Equity Framework to define vulnerable communities.
- Publishing resources to support local financing strategies and investments.
- The 5<sup>th</sup> Climate Assessment launched in 2022.
- ICARP played a key role in supporting statewide efforts such as the California Climate Adaptation Strategy and the Extreme Heat Action Plan.
- Development of resilience and adaptation grant programs through the 2021 State Climate Budget.

### **Item 10: ICARP 2025 Priorities**

Edwards led a discussion and presentation of 2025 priorities for the ICARP. All priorities presented are in DRAFT form and remain largely unchanged from 2024 priorities with a few additions. Suggested priorities include:

- Actionable research and resilience metrics. California leads in climate science to support resilience through the 5<sup>th</sup> Climate Change Assessment. Our focus is on actionable research and supporting metrics.
- Decision support tools for local adaptation planning. ICARP really provides tools, grants, and support for local adaptation planning with a focus on equity for vulnerable communities. Through resources like the Adaptation Planning Guide and the Clearinghouse discussed in the History Discussion, tools can be developed such as grants to empower communities with science-based practical solutions.
- Strategic and Aligned Engagement. ICARP seeks to reduce stakeholder fatigue by fostering efficient and inclusive engagement, particularly with vulnerable communities and Tribal nations. The goal is to coordinate across sectors, maximize impact, and reduce redundancies. This is happening across all of LCI including ICARP and within the Strategic Growth Council.
- Innovative funding and financing. Provide funding strategies including public/private partnerships to support long-term resilience, leverage programs like APGP and RRGP to align with federal funds and bring resources to communities.

- Partnerships for innovation. This is intended to think about collaborating with academia, local governments and the private sector to make sure research is turned into practical solutions to meet local needs.
- Interagency Coordination for Statewide Adaptation. The goal is to strengthen interagency collaboration for unified adaptation efforts and link strategies to local actions.

Edwards noted an additional goal is to avoid “siloeing” work as we’ve done in the past and make adaptation efforts more holistic and cohesive. After the presentation, the following TAC discussion was recorded:

- Bengtsson noted some of the wording is different than previous years’ priorities and asked if this marks a significant departure from past years.
  - Edwards responded the priorities are very similar, but the priorities around engagement and coordination are much more explicit. Historically, there have been separate goals around equity, but we are trying to incorporate that into all of the priorities.
- Bengtsson added that regarding engagement, many other agencies such as CPUC are dealing with stakeholder fatigue and asked whether these priorities are only for ICARP or across all agencies.
  - Edwards said that while it’s focused on ICARP, there is a need for coordination across all agencies. ICARP will look for opportunities to plug in with others to try and reduce stakeholder fatigue in as many places as possible. One example is recent work with the Strategic Growth Council to break large events apart and turn them into more regional engagement opportunities. Michael McCormick and Farallon Strategies are assisting in this effort.
- Jameson said the priorities are generally good, but suggested the TAC could look at how they impact rural and agricultural communities. Agricultural stakeholders have said that discussions around the VCP may not reflect agriculture’s needs. Even if agriculture is specifically covered in the vulnerable communities definition, people within that community do not see themselves reflected. The CDFA Agricultural Resiliency Strategy could assist with expanding engagement.
  - Edwards agreed.
- Viola thanked staff for their work on the priorities and noted that some of them are focused on specific products/outcomes, and some are focused more on processes. Much of the work appears to cut across all of the priorities, and there may be a risk of conflating or overlapping on different issues.
  - Edwards noted a goal is to avoid having work fall into different buckets and categories for future report outs. Many of these priorities do cut across a number of issues. We will work to make sure the priorities aren’t confusing.
- Passero highlighted the value of integrating components of climate adaptation, climate change, resilience, and greenhouse gas emissions. Historically, greenhouse gas emission reduction discussions started first, so it moved along its own track. There is a need to think holistically about all aspects of climate change to avoid redundancies and competition for planning and funding purposes. For the priorities, where does this need for integration come in?
  - Edwards said we will need to investigate ways to ensure adaptation and mitigation efforts are in alignment.
- Parfrey suggested a “belt and suspenders” approach for priorities so things like climate goals and equity activities cut across everything we do but can also stand on their own when needed. He suggested a big idea would be to stop being “maladaptive” and avoid putting money after projects that aren’t going to serve California in 10, 15, or 20 years due to the impacts of climate change. The TAC could be positioned to raise red flags.
  - Edwards agreed that thinking about the investments needed for adaptation is important in the long run. We have to be able to tell the story and make a case for it.

- Bengtsson asked how/whether the CLEE Memo changed the emphasis on these priorities.
  - Edwards said the Memo reflected a lot of what was already known, but it was useful to have it in writing with a full analysis. It is reflected in these priorities, but since it is a new document, there may be additional pieces that could be incorporated.

#### **Item 11: General Public Comment**

Magill facilitated general public comment. Two public comments were provided:

- Nina Knierim, CORE provided input on private funding and innovation that could be done from the State level for climate adaptation and resilience projects. Knierim suggested private companies could help invest in projects to benefit their own infrastructure and communities. The workforce as well the livelihoods will be impacted by climate change and affect corporations' bottom line.
- Michael McCormick, Farallon Strategies commented on the urgency of ecosystem collapse and the cascading effects it could have on everything the TAC discusses. McCormick urged the TAC to consider the outcomes of the biodiversity COP to think through how we get ahead of some of the impacts to natural, working, and urban lands.

#### **Item 12: Closing Comments and Adjourn**

Edwards provided closing comments, noting that in the coming year the TAC could have more topical agenda items on specific items like Cal Heat Score and the Vulnerable Communities Platform. Edwards added she would like to meet with TAC members to help inform future agendas and schedule a TAC meeting in Allensworth. She thanked participants and members of the public for attending and adjourned the meeting at 2:47pm.