#### Governor's Office of Land Use and Climate Innovation (LCI)

#### **Integrated Climate Adaptation and Resiliency Program (ICARP)**

**Technical Advisory Committee (TAC)** 

# March 7, 2025

## **SUMMARY**

#### **TAC Members Present:**

- Abby Edwards, LCI
- Jacob Alvarez<sup>1</sup>, City of Coachella
- Nathan Bengtsson, PG&E
- Allison Brooks, Bay Area Regional Collaborative
- Karalee Browne, Institute for Local Government
- Kim Clark, Southern California Association of Governments
- Grant Davis, Sonoma County Water Agency
- Alex Ghenis<sup>2</sup>, Accessible Climate Strategies
- Clesi Bennett<sup>3</sup>, California Natural Resources Agency
- Lucy Levin, California Environmental Protection Agency<sup>4</sup>
- Virginia Jameson, California Department of Food and Agriculture

- Denise Kadara, Allensworth Progressive Association
- David Loya, City of Arcata
- Nayamin Martinez, Central California Environmental Justice Network
- Jimmy Tran, California State Transportation Agency<sup>5</sup>
- Robyn Fennig, California Governor's Office of Emergency Services
- Jonathan Parfrey, Climate Resolve
- Linda Helland, California Department of Public Health
- Roberto Carlos Torres, Institute for Local Government
- Clare Winterton, The Solutions Project<sup>6</sup>
- John Wentworth, Town of Mammoth Lakes

### **TAC Members Absent:**

- Will Madrigal, Jr., Climate Science Alliance
- Michelle Passero, The Nature Conservancy

## Roll Call & Housekeeping

Sam Magill, Sacramento State University College of Continuing Education, reviewed the agenda and discussed meeting logistics for in person and online attendees. Interpreter Maya Fonseca provided instructions for any attendees requiring Spanish translation; no participants required Spanish translation. Elea Becker Lowe, LCI conducted a roll call. With 21 members present, a quorum was reached, and the meeting was called to order.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Participated remotely; location publicly accessible in compliance with the Bagley Keene Open Meetings Act

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Participate remotely; counts towards quorum within the Bagley Keene Open Meetings Act

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Alternate for Amanda Hanson, California Natural Resources Agency

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Alternate for Sarah Izant, California Environmental Protection Agency

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Alternate for Darwin Moosavi, California State Transportation Agency

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Alternate for Gloria Walton, The Solutions Project

## Approval of Draft Meeting Minutes

Magill led discussion and approval of the October 25, 2024, TAC meeting minutes. After a brief introduction, the following conversation was recorded:

No discussion was provided.

#### **Public Comment**

None.

Kim Clark made a motion to approve the October 25, 2024, meeting minutes. Linda Helland seconded. With 18 ayes, 0 notes, and 3 abstentions, the minutes were approved.

Aye: Abby Edwards, Jacob Alvarez, Nathan Bengsston, Allison Brooks, Karalee Browne, Kim Clark, Grant Davis, Alex Ghenis, Clesi Bennett, Lucy Levin, Virginia Jameson, Denise Kadara, David Loya, Nayamin Martinez, Jimmy Tran, Robyn Fennig, Jonathan Parfrey, Linda Helland, Roberto Carlos Torres, Clare Winterton, John Wentworth

No: None.

Abstain: Clesi Bennett, David Loya, Karalee Browne

#### **TAC Member Report Out**

LCI

Abby Edwards provided opening remarks and recognition of TAC members, including:

- TAC member Nayamin Martinez was recently recognized as the 2025 James Irvine Foundation award winner; her leadership and dedication makes a difference for communities in the Central Valley.
- TAC member Jonathan Parfrey was recently appointed to the LAC Blue Ribbon Commission to support resilience and sustainable recovery from the LA fires.
- TAC member Roberto Carlos Torres was appointed as the senior environmental justice coordinator for the San Francisco Department of the Environment.

### California Governor's Office of Emergency Services (CalOES)

Robyn Fennig, CalOES, provided an update on recent activities including a mitigation summit in December 2024 and the recent Los Angeles fires. The mitigation summit was well attended; Fennig thanked participants and noted the summit took place immediately before the LA fire disaster.

Regarding the fires, CalOES is in the midst of significant recovery operations. To date, \$84 million in disaster assistance funding has been dispersed. CalOES is closely coordinating operations with the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA). Two in-person disaster recovery coordination centers have been set up to assist with efforts. 250 individual assistance requests have been granted; over 3,000 registrants are queued. \$1.3 billion in hazard mitigation work alone is projected: this represents the largest 30 day estimate in the program's history and exceeds Hurricanes Katrina, Sandy, or Maria. Finally, CalOES is also working on hazardous waste removal, including household hazardous waste removal from 13,000 residential parcels, 300 commercial parcels, 700 electric vehicles, and about 400 energy storage systems. This work is the first step in large debris removal, which is typically the biggest lift for communities after a wildfire.

#### California Department of Public Health (CDPH)

Linda Helland, CDPH, provided an update on CDPH LA fire recovery efforts, the California 5<sup>th</sup> Climate Assessment, and extreme heat-related outreach and planning.

For the LA fire recovery effort, CDPH has assisted in vital record replacement, laboratory testing of water, soil, and ash, and mobilizing to provide supportive services to fire victims in collaboration with other State and federal agencies.

CDPH has offered to coordinate development of the public health report for the 5<sup>th</sup> Climate Assessment. This involves coordination with CalFIRE, the California Department of Water resources, and the California Environmental Protection Agency (CalEPA). CDPH will provide an opportunity for input from community members and academic partners, including from the CDPH Climate Change and Health Advisory Committee.

For extreme heat and climate events, CDPH is launching a public outreach effort for local health jurisdictions to address the health impacts of climate change, including in jurisdictions where acknowledging climate change may be challenging. This, in addition to bi-monthly community of practice meetings for local health jurisdictions. CDPH is also working with three Tribes to complete climate plans: the Pala Band of Mission Indians is also completing a Tribal heat mitigation planning starter kit; Tule River is creating a Tribal hazard mitigation plan with special attention paid to human health impacts; Habematolel Pomo of Upper Lake is developing a climate vulnerability assessment with a focus on human health. Finally, CDPH Climate Surveillance Section is preparing a summary on behavioral health risk factors. Questions focus on experiences with extreme heat, its physical and mental health impacts, how people stay cool, and how people access clean air during wildfire events. Previous surveys show significant impacts to vulnerable populations such as youth and the transgender community.

CDPH also works on syndromic surveillance of the effects of extreme heat and works with local emergency departments to provide early warning of extreme heat and other climate-related conditions. Since 2024, CDPH has increased participation of local emergency departments from 30 to 155 (from a statewide total of 331). Also at the local level, CDPH is working on weatherization pilot projects for farm workers and their families to improve homes and health outcomes. Finally, the CDPH Environmental Investigations Branch is pilot testing a wildfire smoke curriculum for community health workers to share in wildfire situations.

#### California Natural Resources Agency (CNRA)

Clesi Bennett, CNRA, provide updates on CNRA department activities related to the LA wildfires and wildfire resilience generally. CalFire is a critical funder and implementer of wildfire resilience activities at the local level and has nearly doubled its fire protection staff and budget since 2019. This investment includes investments in firefighting equipment, forecasting technology, and resilience activities such as defensible space/home hardening. Other departments within CNRA including the Department of Conservation and regional conservancies have also provided resiliency support (often in collaboration with local firesafe councils). CNRA has also entered into agreements with the Karuk Tribe as part of Senator Dodd's SB 310 to support implementation of cultural burns. This effort recognizes Tribal sovereignty and addresses historical injustices where cultural burns were outlawed, allowing Tribes to build fire resilience on their own ancestral lands.

Aside from wildfire-related activities, CNRA is also finalizing the 2024 update to the California Adaptation Strategy; this year will also mark the first year for the rollout of Proposition 4 funding. Proposition 4 invests \$10 billion in resilience over the coming years. CNRA launched a <u>survey</u> to help make the grant writing process for Proposition 4 as easy as possible; the survey is open until April 18.

#### Town of Mammoth Lakes/Eastern Sierra Sustainable Recreation Partnership

John Wentworth, Town of Mammoth Lakes, provided an update on fire resilience projects in and around the Town of Mammoth Lakes, the primary economic driver for seven surrounding counties. Federal funding was recently suspended, leaving significant gaps in funding for fire resilience activities. To make up for shortfalls, the Town of Mammoth Lakes may need to use its own general fund from tourism revenue to hire fuel treatment contractors. Related to local resilience efforts, the CalRec Vision was produced to develop sustainable recreation, including maintaining fire resilience efforts in the Sierra. The Vision has been adopted by Mammoth Lakes and the Eastern Sierra Council of Governments; Mono and Inyo Counties are expected to adopt it soon. All parties will use the Vision to secure funding for additional wildfire resilience efforts, particular as it relates to sustainable recreation.

#### **TAC Member Discussion**

Edwards led a discussion session with TAC members on the state agency updates listed above. The input and questions received are as follows; chair/staff responses are provided below as sub-bullets:

- Roberto Carlos Torres thanked CNRA for its efforts to make the Proposition 4 grant process as easy as
  possible, and noted the Strategic Growth Council and Institute for Local Government have worked to
  streamline grant writing and access to bond funding.
- Parfrey noted that state agency staff lost homes in the LA wildfires and asked if CNRA has reached out to staff personally impacted by the fires.
  - Bennet confirmed that it had; Edwards confirmed that all agencies are conducting this outreach.
- Fennig noted that a recent Rhode Island Circuit Court decision forced the federal government to disperse funds. The decision is available online at <a href="https://storage.courtlistener.com/recap/gov.uscourts.rid.58912/gov.uscourts.rid.58912.50.0\_2.pdf">https://storage.courtlistener.com/recap/gov.uscourts.rid.58912/gov.uscourts.rid.58912.50.0\_2.pdf</a>.
- Alex Ghenis asked if CalOES if energy storage units destroyed in the LA fires were behind-the-meter home energy, commercial energy, or substation energy storage?
  - o Fenig was unsure where they were located and offered to follow up.
- Ghenis asked CDPH why transgendered youth appear to be more heavily impacted by extreme heat than cisgendered youth.
  - Helland responded that like other vulnerable populations, transgendered youth suffer from a lack of services and marginalized living conditions, exacerbating the impacts of extreme heat.

# ICARP TAC Charter Update

Edwards led a review of the revised TAC Charter, noting that key changes have been made regarding the use of Robert's Rules of Order and quorum requirements. Hannah Bliska, ICARP, walked through specific changes, including:

- TAC member roles and responsibilities
- Member attendance requirements
- Rules for attending virtually/satellite location specifications
- Decision-making through the use of Robert's Rules of Order
- Quorum requirements

#### **TAC Member Discussion**

Edwards led a discussion session with TAC members on the state agency updates listed above. The input and questions received are as follows; chair/staff responses are provided below as sub-bullets:

- Nathan Bengtsson, PG&E, asked for more clarification of conflict-of-interest expectations.
  - Edwards noted that as TAC members review meeting packets and agendas, if an issue they think might be a conflict arises, they should reach out to ICARP staff and counsel for a determination. Bengtsson suggested under "Decision-making," add in a sentence to read "members should abstain if a conflict can be reasonably known."
- Bengtsson asked if the definition of "vulnerable" has been added to the TAC Vision and Principles.
  - Edwards confirmed that it has.
- Nayamin Martinez, Central California Environmental Justice Network, asked if recusing was only needed for voting/decision items. Martinez also asked if members should leave the room for any recusal items.
  - Edwards confirmed it only applies to decision items and asked that members leave the room for items they would like to recuse themselves at the start of the agenda item.
- Martinez asked what accommodations need to be made for satellite locations if members need to take the meeting remotely.
  - Jacob Alvarez noted that members need to notify ICARP staff with the address of the remote location and post the agenda in a public space near the location. This space must be open to the public if they wish to attend in the satellite location.
- Allison Brooks, Bay Area Regional Collaborative, noted that the Charter is written at a very high level and doesn't include goals and specifics for what the TAC is trying to achieve.
  - Edwards responded the Charter is intentionally high-level; the TAC priorities can be modified to include specific goals for each year.
- Parfrey noted changes to federal rules may impact how the TAC interacts. He also suggested looking at the Brown Act and how local bodies conduct business.
- David Loya, City of Arcata, asked if members participate in a specific grant, are they required to recuse themselves from discussion around the grant?
  - Edwards will ask ICARP counsel for guidance on Brown Act issues and recusal requirements.
- Alvarez suggested TAC membership should be expanded to include a seat for school/educational representatives. Denise Kadara, Allensworth Progressive Association, agreed and added that a "youth expertise" seat be added.
  - o Edwards agreed.
- Carlos Torres asked for clarification of term lengths for TAC members.
  - Edwards commented that section 2 of the Charter states terms will last 2 years.

Edwards closed the item by noting that the Charter will be updated based on the discussion and consultation with ICARP counsel and brought back to the next TAC meeting for approval.

#### **Public Comment**

None.

Alvarez made a motion to table the item. Wenworth seconded. With 21 ayes, 0 notes, and 0 abstentions, the item was tabled.

Aye: Abby Edwards, Jacob Alvarez, Nathan Bengsston, Allison Brooks, Karalee Browne, Kim Clark, Grant Davis, Alex Ghenis, Clesi Bennett, Lucy Levin, Virginia Jameson, Denise Kadara, David Loya, Nayamin

Martinez, Jimmy Tran, Robyn Fennig, Jonathan Parfrey, Linda Helland, Roberto Carlos Torres, Clare Winterton, John Wentworth

## ICARP Programmatic Updates and Staff Report

Edwards provided ICARP Programmatic Updates, including introductions to new staff. New staff members include Catherine Foster, Emely Anico, and Azura Haley.

Haley provided updates on the California 5<sup>th</sup> Climate Assessment, including new author teams for:

- Climate Impacts to the Economy
- Racial Equity and Climate Justice
- Climate Displacement and Migration

Haley also noted the 5<sup>th</sup> Climate Assessment team is currently recruiting new Tribal Advisory Group members from inland deserts, Los Angeles, the Central Coast, and San Francisco Bay Area regions.

Haley also noted ICARP is updating its Climate Services Vulnerable Communities Platform. ICARP has entered into a contract with the foundation for California Community Colleges to help low-capacity organizations build the skills needed to create climate vulnerability assessments using the Platform.

Regarding Grant Program updates, Haley noted the Extreme Heat and Community Resilience Program is contracting with 49 first round grantees. Two technical assistance convenings for Adaptation Planning Grant Program were held in January on case studies for collaborative engagement. The Regional resilience planning and implementation grant program held a grantee workshop on March 4<sup>th</sup> on community engagement strategies.

Finally, Haley noted LCI is engaged with CalOES and community planning and capacity building partners to coordinate the development of a long-term recovery plan in LA following the fires. The mission of this group is to support local and Tribal governments to identify gaps in the recovery process. CNRA and ICARP will also develop the timeline and engagement strategy for the Extreme Heat Action Plan update.

#### **TAC Member Discussion**

Edwards led a discussion session with TAC members on the state agency updates listed above. The input and questions received are as follows; chair/staff responses are provided below as sub-bullets:

- Edwards was recently appointed as the senior deputy director over the planning and policy unity within LCI; this position oversees ICARP work and the land use portfolio.
- Ghenis asked if check in meetings were held with each grantee within the ICARP Regional Resilience Planning and Implementation Grant Program.
  - o Edwards confirmed that check-ins were held for all 16 grantees.

### **ICARP 2025 Priorities**

Edwards led a discussion of 2025 ICARP Priorities, noting that the format of the priorities list has shifted from the standard 6 categories in previous years to more closely align with the goals of the Newsom administration. TAC members Parfrey, Loya, Browne, Wentworth, Clark, and Alvarez chose to recuse themselves from the conversation due to perceived conflict of interest with the priorities as they apply to potential future grants. After the opening, Kim Danko, ICARP, provided a detailed review of the priorities:

- Cultivate trust and empower communities: deepen partnerships with Tribes and indigenous
  communities by providing consistent engagement opportunities and honoring Tribal sovereignty.
  Develop and maintain relationships with current grantees, local governments, and vulnerable
  communities across the state by enhancing participatory and equitable grant processes that
  prioritize identified needs and increase funding opportunities.
- Highlight the impact and transformative outcomes of work through storytelling by developing tailored outreach campaigns/case studies to showcase tangible results of climate investments and success stories.
- 3. Expand localized data, research and tool by further developing resources to help local governments identify their vulnerabilities, achieve adaptation measures, and identify consistencies across regions to streamline adaptation efforts.
- 4. Implement innovative adaptation and resilience action through prioritization of investments in communities most vulnerable to climate impacts. This will fill ICARP's role as an interagency connector to comprehensively and collaboratively advance equitable adaptation and resilience outcomes.

#### **TAC Member Discussion**

Edwards led a discussion session with TAC members on the state agency updates listed above. The input and questions received are as follows; chair/staff responses are provided below as sub-bullets:

- Helland suggested adding "improved health" to the co-benefits of resilience efforts (such as job creation cost savings from disasters) to priority 2.
- Kadara suggested modifications to priority 1 above to include "youth" in the description. Allensworth
  is working with UC Berkeley to provide public health curriculum in K-8 schools on environmental
  issues such as impacts to air/water quality. This curriculum will help kids better understand
  environmental impacts of climate change but also allow them to bring information back to their
  parents and families.
- Carlos Torres agreed adding public health to the priorities is important. He also raised a concern that
  a significant number of TAC members chose to recuse themselves from the discussion and asked for
  clarification on when recusal is necessary.
  - Doug Bojack, ICARP counsel, noted that the priorities discussion does not require recusal as they are not related to specific plans and specifications for individual projects or the solicitation of bids.
- Bengtsson asked if there were specific metrics to determine the success of meeting the ICARP priorities.
  - Edwards noted the priorities are intended to provide guidance to all ICARP programs and efforts as opposed to strict measures of success for each program.
- Grant Davis, Sonoma Water, suggested some measure of success should be developed to determine
  whether ICARP programs are meeting the priorities discussed. He also agreed with the need to
  include youth in the priorities.
- Martinez stressed the need to include language access when considering access to programs; many communities may not be able to participate in programs due to lack of language access.
- Ghenis asked how priorities are balanced across all state agencies and regions. He also suggested
  building a place for community journalism into priority 2 above regarding storytelling. Storytelling
  should also be done in such a way to meet the needs of many vulnerable communities, including
  people with disabilities or the deaf community.

- Edwards noted that a lot of state programs have "reaching diverse populations throughout the state" into grant criteria.
- Bennett stressed the importance of highlighting the connection between public health and greenhouse gas emissions.

#### **Public Comment**

None.

Fennig made a motion to approve the priorities as amended based on the conversation. Martinez seconded. With 15 ayes, 0 notes, and 6 abstentions, the item was approved as amended.

Aye: Abby Edwards, Nathan Bengsston, Allison Brooks, Grant Davis, Alex Ghenis, Clesi Bennett, Lucy Levin, Virginia Jameson, Denise Kadara, Nayamin Martinez, Jimmy Tran, Robyn Fennig, Linda Helland, Roberto Carlos Torres, Clare Winterton, Clesi Bennett, Davide Loya,

Abstain/Recuse: Jacob Alvarez, Karalee Browne, Kim Clark, David Loya, Jonathan Parfrey, John Wentworth

### Vulnerable Communities Definition

Edwards provided the current ICARP definition of vulnerable communities as follows:

Climate vulnerability describes the degree to which the natural built and human systems are at risk of exposure to climate change impacts, vulnerable communities. Experience heightened risk and increased sensitivity to climate change and have less capacity and fewer resources to cope with, adopt, to or recover from climate impacts. These disproportionate effects are caused by the physical, built and environmental, social, political and or environment, or and or economic factors which are exacerbated by climate impacts. These factors include, but are not limited to, race class sexual orientation and identification, national origin, income, inequality and disability.

Edwards noted that ICARP developed a resource guide in 2018 to expand on the definition as a starting point for practitioners to use when first considering how to define vulnerable communities in an adaptation context.

After discussing the resource guide, Edwards provided the revised vulnerable communities definition to include *gender and gender identification* in the last sentence.

#### **TAC Member Discussion**

Edwards led a discussion session with TAC members on the state agency updates listed above. The input and questions received are as follows; chair/staff responses are provided below as sub-bullets:

- TAC members discussed whether to include gender, gender identity, gender identification, or "sex and gender identification."
- Several TAC members agreed "sex and gender identification" may be appropriate. Clark noted sex is assigned at birth, while gender is not.
- Bennett suggested all of the proposed terms should be defined in the resource guide discussed above.
- Fennig suggested "gender expression" should also be defined in the resource guide.
- Helland noted that the CDPH gender equity team uses the term "gender identity." "Sex" implies identity based on anatomy; CDPH no longer uses sex as a proxy for gender identity.
   Sex may include intersex; gender identity can include transgender and non-binary.

- Virginia Jameson, CDFA, commended the bravery of public commenters (see below) and said that the definition should include sex, gender, and gender identification.
- Browne supported the inclusion of "sex, gender, and gender identification" in the definition.
- Bennett asked if anyone from the transgender community has presented their preference at TAC meetings.
- Edwards noted that these presentations have not been held; ICARP has received comments from a range of participants and communities.
- TAC members discussed convening a subcommittee to refine the definition or vote on revised text to read "sexual orientation, sex, gender, and gender expression."

#### **Public Comment**

- Dr. Nancy Cohen, Gender Equity Policy Institute, congratulated the TAC for addressing the issue and noted that while gender has not been explicitly included in the vulnerable communities definition, it is included in the work being carried out. It is important to explicitly address it in the definition; the United Nations Framework on the Convention on Climate Change adopted a gender action plan in 2019 and has since enshrined the principle of advancing gender equality in climate action. Dr. Cohen advocated for the use of "sex, gender, gender identity, and gender expression." She noted that if the TAC chooses only "gender identity and sex," the Gender Equity Policy Institute will need to oppose the decision, as it may reinforce the invisibility of women.
- Siobhan Reed suggested sex, sexual orientation, gender, and gender identity in the definition. This
  inclusion will cover a lot of specific terms for the LGBTQ+ community, and all should be considered.
  Trans people are often underemployed, disenfranchise, and generally have difficulty finding work or
  adequate housing and are very vulnerable to climate change impacts.
- Miss Margaret Gordon, West Oakland, noted involvement in environmental justice work for 30 years.
  Gordon said that in addition to discussions of gender and sex, vulnerable communities also include
  discussions of class and infrastructure and the ability (or inability) of vulnerable community
  members to participate in these types of discussions. Vulnerable communities need both the
  capacity and infrastructure to participate in these discussions.

After the discussion, two proposals were provided for consideration by the TAC:

- First proposal (Edwards): Table the discussion and convene a subcommittee to further refine the definition.
- Second proposal (Loya): Vote on the definition as revised to read, "...sexual orientation, sex, gender, gender identity, and gender expression."

Edwards noted that if the first proposal to table the issue and convene a subcommittee were approved, no vote would be needed on the second proposal at this time.

Kadara made a motion to table the issue and convene a subcommittee for further discussion; Wentworth seconded. With 11 ayes, 8 noes, and 2 abstentions, the item was tabled, and a subcommittee will be formed. Further action on the second proposal was not recorded as a result.

Aye: Alex Ghenis, Clesi Bennett, Lucy Levin, Virginia Jameson, Denise Kadara, Jimmy Tran, Linda Helland, Clare Winterton, Kim Clark, John Wentworth, Jacob Alvarez,

Nay: Abby Edwards, Allison Brooks, Karalee Browne, Grant Davis, David Loya, Nayamin Martinez, Robyn Fennig, Roberto Carlos Torres

Abstain/Recuse: Nathan Bengsston, Jonathan Parfrey

## California 5<sup>th</sup> Climate Assessment Reports

Elea Becker Lowe, ICARP, provided an update on California's 5<sup>th</sup> Climate Assessment (Assessment) Reports. Becker Lowe provided a brief overview of the effort, noting that the Assessment is an extensive compilation of research and informational products. ICARP aims to uplift the best available science and information lived, experience, expertise across the State and really understand the impacts of climate change between now and the end of the century and identify adaptation strategies that help us build resilience across the State. The Assessment contributes to the scientific foundation that informs many state policies, plans, programs, and guidance, and promotes effective action across the state for challenges associated with climate change. In total, the Assessment will include 60 distinct reports developed by a range of experts, communities, and Tribal research teams. More information on the Assessment is available online at <a href="https://lci.ca.gov/climate/icarp/climate-assessment/">https://lci.ca.gov/climate/icarp/climate-assessment/</a>.

Five of the author teams joined the TAC meeting to provide specific updates on their reports, including:

- Jesse Norris, UCLA, Los Angeles Regional Report
- Kara Voss, California Department of Insurance, Climate Adaptation, Finance, and Insurance Report
- McKenna Maxwell, Climate Impacts to the Economy Report
- Margaretta Lin and Charisma Acey, Racial Equity and Climate Justice Report
- Betsy Popken and Hoisan Oyazi, Climate Induced Human Migration and Displacement Report

### Los Angeles Regional Report

Norris led a discussion of the LA Regional Report, noting that the report includes all of Los Angeles and Orange Counties, as well as portions of San Bernardino and Riverside Counties. This portion of the Assessment seeks to understand the regional hazards associated with climate change such as extreme heat, drought, precipitation, landslides, hazardous air quality, and wildfire. The report will look at the expected physical and ecological changes associated with climate change and their impact to the region, impacts of these changes for natural and built systems, and adaptation strategies recommended to address these challenges. It will also include information on the disparate impacts of climate change across a range of demographic groups. All information and recommendations in the report are based on a range of high-resolution climate projects for all of California and uses both statistical and dynamic downscaling to apply the data to the LA region.

A core component of report development focuses on community engagement and outreach to make it as societally relevant as possible. The NGO Tree People is conducting outreach to solicit information and priorities from community members to help inform the report and provide direct stories for inclusion in the final work product.

#### Climate Adaptation, Finance, and Insurance Report

Voss discussed the Climate Adaptation, Finance, and Insurance Report for the Assessment, noting the report is an acknowledgement of the fact that climate change poses a transformational shift to California's funding and finance outlook. Although there have been significant investments in the past decade, there is a need for a consolidated resource to serve as a reference for which mechanisms are available to develop and implement funding for climate adaptation.

Climate Adaptation Finance is defined in the report as the financial flows that support adaptation and resilience activities, including activities that seek to prevent harm, reduce or transfer risk, recover from impacts, or promote economic, social, and natural ecosystem benefits across all sectors. Adaptation

Finance includes a wide range of capital flows from both public and private capital in developing and industrialized countries.

The report covers adaptation finance as well as adaptation funding and provides some context on the differences and complementary nature of finance vs. funding. It also covers disaster risk finance in addition to and separate from insurance; a lot of innovation and insurance that can be used for adaptation that might be beyond the scope of responding or reacting to an individual disaster or other extreme event. It also includes tracking adaptation, finance, and funding for adaptation. Notably, the report does not include funding for greenhouse gas mitigation, as significant resources and programs are already dedicated to emission reduction and mitigation. The report lays out both California's climate adaptation financing past/present and future options and is intended to be a resource for things like future wildfire resilience and recovery.

### Climate Impacts to the Economy Report

Maxwell presented the Climate Impacts to the Economy Report; it will address the fiscal and economic impacts of current and projected climate change events/trends in California, as well as the cost/benefits of adaptation responses to build a climate resilient economy. The report will also include a high-level section on the economy-wide impacts of climate change with regards to gross domestic product impacts from climate hazards, as well as subsections on agriculture, coastal economies, freshwater systems, and forestry. It will then discuss infrastructure and services such as energy, transportation, real estate, government operations, and tourism. A human capital chapter will look at labor, education, and health impacts. Finally, the report will look at cross-sector interactions and varying impacts of climate change across all State regions.

#### Racial Equity and Climate Justice Report

Acey provided an overview of the Racial Equity and Climate Justice Report. The objective of the report is to compile the best available science and information about racial equity and climate justice. This includes identifying potential solutions that build resilience to current and future climate impacts by synthesizing existing research and informational resources since the 4th assessment, integrating subject specific community priorities on racial equity and climate justice from across the State through community engagement/community-based partnerships. The report also aims to create informational resources and tools on racial equity and climate justice that can guide State and local policy for planning and action. Often when we look at racialized disparities for environmental justice or climate change, the analysis focuses on people and their identities instead of the structure/conditions that produce disparate impacts- this report will focus on the latter.

Development of the report uses a "people-centric" approach to life up highly impacted groups, including those who are included in these types of efforts such as incarcerated/formerly incarcerated individuals, migrant farm workers, indigenous populations, black communities, etc. For example, Californians with a criminal record may have challenges finding housing and employment: both conditions are directly linked to disparate impacts from climate change. We're also looking at intersectionalities between vulnerable groups that may create unique forms of discrimination and vulnerability that make it harder to adapt to climate change. The report team continues to look for representatives from statewide climate justice networks and coalitions to advance this work across California.

Lin then reviewed the research justice framework used for the report, including:

- Recognition of community as experts
- Equitable access to information impacting the community
- Community control over information
- Capacity to produce knowledge reflecting the community's experiences
- Capacity to use community knowledge to effectively advance community change (particularly structural change)

The report recognizes the importance of mainstream/institutional knowledge but acknowledges that this knowledge co-exists with community and experiential knowledge. It also stresses the importance of entering into agreements with communities for collaborative decision-making and producing research that is actionable for positive outcomes. A launch of outreach efforts is scheduled for April 28<sup>th</sup> from 10am-noon at UC Berkeley via hybrid meeting.

### Climate Induced Human Migration and Displacement Report

Popken reviewed the Climate Induced Human Migration and Displacement Report. The purpose of the report is to identify policy, resource and research gaps in human migration and displacement due to severe weather events. The LA fires are a prime example, with people displaced from their homes either temporarily or permanently. The Camp Fire in Paradise, California, similarly displaced nearly the entire population, with the highest percentage of people moving to Chico. The report seeks to determine what the impacts of this displacement and migration are for both their displaced and receiving communities.

The report is organized broadly recognized sectors such as community identity, economy, housing, education, etc. to help inform policy decisions to address impacts of by climate-induced migration. It also seeks to understand what draws people to a specific community such as affordable housing or work opportunities.

#### **TAC Member Discussion**

Edwards led a discussion session with TAC members on the state agency updates listed above. The input and questions received are as follows; chair/staff responses are provided below as sub-bullets:

- Wentworth asked for a future TAC agenda item discussing how Assessment information will get to policy makers and hear from authors on implementation steps for report recommendations.
  - Edwards said the ICARP team will include this item on the next agenda.
- Martinez noted that most of the author teams are based out of either the San Francisco Bay Area or LA and stressed the importance of including other parts of the State.
  - Becker Lowe commented that only five of the author teams presented during the meeting, but there are teams from both UC and CSU from around the state. Additionally, nine regional reports will be produced covering the entire State.
- Ghenis stressed the importance of including disability in the climate justice report and suggested reaching out to Victor Pineda at UC Berkeley for more information.

## CalFire Grantee Case Study

Taylor Nelson, Butte County Firesafe Council, provided an overview of the Council and a grantee case study related to the 2024 Park Fire in Butte County. The Council includes 34 full-time staff to work on fuel reduction, wildfire education, and recovery efforts after a fire occurs; it currently has 20 grants and more than 50 active, on-the-ground projects. In 2024 alone, the Council and partner organizations treated over 3,000 acres (not including residential assistance for defensible space clearing). Additionally, the Council

operates 3 educational programs for K-6 students; in 2024 1,500 students went through programs throughout Butte County.

Nelson noted Butte County is geographically diverse, ranging from the floor of the Sacramento Valley to over 5,000 feet. It is comprised of 7 separate ridges and includes urban, rural agricultural, and forested communities. Common fuel treatments in forested areas include hand thinning, mastication, prescribed burning, grazing, and herbicide application (particularly for areas with scotch broom). 96% of Butte County is considered either high or very high fire hazard severity. Since 2018, 63% of the County's wildland urban interface has burned; up to 51% of the total County has burned. To address ongoing wildfire threat, the Council formed the Butten County Collaborative Group to strengthen strategic partnerships for fore health, ecological restoration, and wildfire safety.

The Park Fire in 2024 was the fastest growing wildfire in California's history, with an average of 10,000 acres burning every hour and impacted the area from Big Chico Creek to the Ishi Wilderness. The Council implemented a CalFire-funded fuel treatment and wildfire prevention effort in the community of Cohasset. Similarly, the Sierra Nevada Conservancy provided funding for fuel treatment on private parcels. Combined, these efforts led to minimal structure loss and significantly reduced impacts to the area, despite being surrounded on all sides by wildfire. A major key to success was community outreach and work with willing property owners to conduct treatments on private property. Additionally, because CalFire knew the area was previously treated, it allowed them to focus efforts on other area, freeing up resources for active firefighting in untreated areas.

#### **TAC Member Discussion**

Edwards led a discussion session with TAC members on the state agency updates listed above. The input and questions received are as follows; chair/staff responses are provided below as sub-bullets:

- Parfrey asked how similar programs can be funded for long-term sustainability, and whether Firesafe Councils help create social cohesion and connectedness to assist with wildfire prevention efforts.
  - Nelson responded long-term maintenance is always challenging. Donations can help cover some of the cost; the Council is also looking into endowments to leverage potentially large donations that can accrue interest for use on maintenance activities. Parcel fees are an option but can be very politically challenging in Butte County.
  - Nelson said that the Council acts as a web to share information and resources within the community. Additionally, because it is a nonprofit as opposed to a public agency, the Council can work directly with a variety of jurisdictions, Tribes, and individuals.

## LA Fires Rapid Assessment Case Study<sup>7</sup>

# Wildfire and Forest Resilience Task Force Action Plan Update

Forest Schafer, California Wildfire and Forest Resilience Task Force (Task Force), provided an update on Task Force activities. The Task Force is an interagency group to determine how wildfire impacts the state, how the State and federal partners can improve investments in wildfire resilience, and how to prioritize decisions to create policy and procedures to support on-the-ground resilience efforts. It includes nearly 24 interagency work groups focused on issues such beneficial fire to recreation, and landowner assistance. Task Force activities are guided by the 2021 Wildfire and Forest Resilience Action Plan. Notably, the Task Force does not

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Note: due to time constraints, this item was removed from the agenda.

have any statutory authority but instead serves as an interagency group to build collaborative solutions to wildfire resilience challenges.

A key product of the Task Force was the Strategic Plan for Expanding the Beneficial Use of Fire. This plan sets aggressive targets in the near term for expanding the use of beneficial fire, including both prescribed and cultural burning. It aims to triple the amount of fire needed to meet state targets for fuel treatments. The only way to achieve these ambitious goals is to look at prescribed fire at scale and build networks of treatment plans with multiple partners (as opposed to individual, one-off treatment projects). One key tool in building this network is federal Potential Operational Delineations (PODs). PODs provide collaborative opportunities for fire officials, Tribes, resource managers, and private landowners to identify the areas where different treatment types may be beneficial, or where fires should be allowed to burn without impacting critical resources or communities. The Task Force also produced the California Wildfire and Landscape Resilience Interagency Treatment Dashboard. The dashboard brings together all reported federal and State treatments and will include Tribal and local treatments in the future. It includes all treatments that are implemented, funded, or permitted.

As a result of these combined efforts, Task Force members have treated over 2 million acres. The Task Force acknowledges there is not a "one size fits all approach" to treatments and wildfire resilience.

### **General Public Comment**

Michael McCormick, Farallon Strategies

McCormick commented Farallon Strategies helps support a variety of climate resilience and adaptation initiatives across the State and county. These initiatives face significant instabilities due to layoffs in the public sector at the federal level and billions of dollars in delayed or cancelled contracts. These impacts are likely to increase in the future; as such a critical need for stability at the State level exists. McCormick encouraged the TAC to move as quickly as possible.

# **Closing Comments**

Edwards provided closing comments, and thanked speakers for providing leadership on critical challenges facing the State. Providing positive examples through collaborative efforts such as Firesafe and the Task Force is useful for bringing local solutions to scale.

Edwards committed to the development of a subcommittee to address the vulnerable communities definition around gender and directed staff to reach out to TAC members in March to solicit volunteers. Edwards also commented the TAC will review and approve the revised Charter at its next meeting.

After closing comments, the meeting was adjourned.